

REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

**MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS
OF
NATIONAL ASSEMBLY**

WEDNESDAY, 20 SEPTEMBER 2006

1. The House met at 15:01.
2. The Deputy Speaker took the Chair and requested members to observe a moment of silence for prayers or meditation.
3. [15:02] Questions - Deputy President.
4. [15:52] Questions – Cluster 2: Social Services and Governance.
5. [17:00] The Speaker made an announcement regarding a request by the Executive for Parliament to review Institutions Supporting Democracy, as well as the Public Service Commission.
6. [17:02] The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved without notice: That the House –

Agreed to.

7. FIRST ORDER [17:04]

Resumption of debate on motion by Chief Whip of the Majority Party, namely

That the House -

(1) noting -

- (a) with grave concern the developments in the Middle East;
- (b) Israel's collective punishment of both the Palestinian and Lebanese peoples;
- (c) the disproportionate response of Israel and the use of military force against civilian targets, resulting in hundreds of deaths and injuries, mainly of women, children and the elderly, the massive destruction of vital life-supporting infrastructure, and the displacement of over a million people;
- (d) the catastrophic humanitarian crisis in Gaza and Lebanon, for which Israel's aggression is responsible;
- (e) the anger and concerns of many sectors of our people - including political parties, trade unions and religious leaders; and
- (f) the commencement of a UN mandated ceasefire on Monday, 14 August 2006;

- (2) believing –
- (a) that the threat of a regional war might become a reality, which will seriously endanger regional and international peace and security;
 - (b) that the actions of Israel are against international law and the Geneva Convention;
 - (c) that the Palestinian people have the right to self-determination and independence in the State of Palestine and that the State of Israel has the right to exist alongside the State of Palestine, within secure borders; and
 - (d) that a negotiated final status agreement would best serve the peoples of Israel, Palestine and Lebanon, and more generally the cause for peace and security in the region; and

- (3) resolves -
- (a) to call upon all parties to desist from any actions which may exacerbate the conflict;
 - (b) to call for the maintenance of a ceasefire by all sides;
 - (c) to call for a negotiated solution of the Israeli, Palestinian and Lebanese prisoner issue;
 - (d) to call upon the UN Security Council to discharge its responsibilities and act with urgency to enforce and maintain the full cessation of hostilities and Israel's withdrawal of its troops at the earliest;
 - (e) to call upon the UN, on the basis of various UN resolutions, to seek a peaceful comprehensive solution; and
 - (f) to call upon the international community and the South African government and people to respond to the catastrophic humanitarian tragedy in the region.

and on an amendment moved by Mr D H M Gibson, namely:

To omit all the words after "That the House -" and to substitute with the following:

- (1) noting -
- (a) with grave concern the recent developments in the Middle East;
 - (b) the devastating loss of life of both the people of Lebanon and Israel;
 - (c) the support of Hezbollah and its terrorist activities by Syria and Iran;
 - (d) the right of self-determination for the people of Palestine and the sovereign right to self-defence of Israel;
 - (e) that South Africa's official foreign policy in the Middle East is the acceptance of a two-state solution and that any attempt to abandon this position will undermine our international credibility; and
 - (f) the commencement of a UN mandated ceasefire on Monday, 14 August 2006;
- (2) resolves that -

- (a) both sides must desist from any actions which may exacerbate the conflict;
- (b) Hezbollah must disarm in line with UN Resolution 1559 and Israel must withdraw its troops from southern Lebanon once this has been achieved;
- (c) Syria and Iran must be condemned for financing, arming and inspiring the conflict;
- (d) a lasting two-state solution must be respected by all parties in the region;
- (e) the UN Security Council act with urgency to enforce and maintain the full cessation of hostilities by both sides; and
- (f) the South African government must focus more on the immediate humanitarian crisis in Zimbabwe, rather than a conflict over which it has little or no influence

and on amendments moved by Mr M B Skosana, namely:

In paragraph (1), to omit subparagraphs (b), (c) and (d); and

In paragraph (2)(b), to omit "Israel" and to substitute "the belligerent parties".

Debate concluded.

Question put: That the amendment moved by Mr D H M Gibson be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES-44: Batyi, F; Bhengu, M J; Blanché, J P I; Camerer, S M; Coetzee, R; Cupido, H B ; Davidson, I O; Ditshetelo, P H K; Doman, W P; Dreyer, A M; Dudley, C; Ellis, M J; Gibson, D H M; Jankielsohn, R; King, R J; Kohler-Barnard, D; Labuschagne, L B; Leon, A J; Lowe, C M; Maduma, L D; Meshoe, K R J; Minnie, K J; Morgan, G R; Mulder, C P; Pule, B E; Rabinowitz, R; Roopnarain, U; Sayedali-Shah, M R; Schmidt, H C; Seaton, S A; Selfe, J; Semple, J A; Simmons, S; Smith, P F; Smuts, M; Spies, W D; Steyn, A C; Swathe, M M; Trent, E W; Van der Merwe, J H; Van der Walt, D; Vezi, T E; Vos, S C; Waters, M.

NOES-156: Abram, S; Anthony, T G; Arendse, J D; Asiya, S E; Asmal, A K; Beukman, F; Bhamjee, Y S; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bloem, D V; Bonhomme, T J; Botha, N G W; Burgess, C V; Cachalia, I M; Cele, M A; Chikunga, L S; Cwele, S C; Dambuzza, B N; Daniels, P; Davies, R H; Dikgacwi, M M; Dithebe, S L; Dlali, D M; Du Toit, D C ; Fihla, N B; Frolick, C T; Gaum, A H; Gigaba, K M N; Gololo, C L; Goniwe, M T; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A ; Hendrickse, P A C; Hogan, B A; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, C B; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khumalo, K K; Khumalo, K M; Khunou, N P; Komphela, B M; Koornhof, G W; Kotwal, Z; Landers, L T; Lekgetho, G; Lekgoro, M M S; Likotsi, M T; Lishivha, T E; Louw, S K; Luthuli, A N; Maake, J J; Mabe, L L; Mabena, D C; Madasa, Z L; Madella, A F; Magau, K R; Magubane, N E ; Mahlaba, T L; Mahlangu-Nkabinde, G L; Mahote, S; Maja, S J; Maloyi, P D N; Maluleka, H P; Maluleke, D K; Martins, B A D; Mashangoane, P R; Mashiane, L M; Mashigo, R J; Masutha, T M; Mathibela, N F; Matlala, M H; Matsemela, M L; Mbili, M E; Mbombo, N D; Meruti, M V; Mgabadelo, H C; Mkhize, Z S; Mkongi, B M; Mnguni, B A; Mnyandu, B J; Moatshe, M S; Modisenyane, L J; Mogale, O M; Mogase, I D; Mohamed, I J; Mohlaloga, M R; Mokoena, A D; Molefe, C T; Moloto, K A; Montsitsi, S D; Morobi, D M; Mosala, B G; Moss, L N; Moss, M I; Motubatse-Houngkpatin, S D; Mshudulu, S A; Mthembu, B; Mthethwa, E N; Mtshali, E; Mzondeki, M J G; Nawa, Z N; Ndzanga, R A; Nel, A C; Nene, M J ; Nene, N M; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngaleka, E; Ngcengwane, N D; Ngcobo, B T; Ngcobo, E N N; Ngculu, L V J; Ngele, N J; Ngwenya, W; Nhlengethwa, D G; Njikelana, S J ; Nogumla, R Z; Ntuli, B M; Ntuli, M M; Ntuli, R S; Nxumalo, M D; Nyambi, A J; Nzimande, L P M; Olifant, D A A; Phadagi, M G; Phungula, J P; Pieterse, R D; Rajbally, S ; Ramodibe, D M; Ramotsamai, C P M; Rasmeni, S M; Rwexana, S P; Saloojee, E; Schippers, J; Schneemann, G D; Seadimo, M D; Sefularo, M; Sibozza, S ; Sibuyana, M W; Sithole, D J; Smith, V G;

Solo, B M; Soty, M M; Surty, M E ; Thabethe, E; Tinto, B; Tolo, L J; Tsenoli, S L; Tshivhase, T J; Tshwete, P; Vadi, I; Van den Heever, R P Z; Van der Merwe, S C ; Van Wyk, A;

ABSTAIN-5: Bhoola, R B; Bici, J; Chang, E S; Nkabinde, N C; Sigcau , S N.

Question not agreed to.

Amendment accordingly negated.

Question put: That the amendments moved by Mr M B Skosana be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES-46: Bhengu, M J; Bici, J; Blanché, J P I; Camerer, S M; Chang, E S; Coetzee, R; Cupido, H B ; Davidson, I O; Ditshetelo, P H K; Doman, W P; Dreyer, A M; Dudley, C; Ellis, M J; Gibson, D H M; Jankielsohn, R; King, R J; Kohler-Barnard, D; Labuschagne, L B; Leon, A J; Meshoe, K R J; Minnie, K J; Morgan, G R; Mulder, C P; Nkabinde, N C; Pule, B E; Rabinowitz, R; Roopnarain, U; Sayedali-Shah, M R; Schmidt, H C; Seaton, S A; Selfe, J; Semple, J A; Sibuyana, M W; Sigcau , S N; Simmons, S; Smith, P F; Smuts, M; Spies, W D; Steyn, A C; Swathe, M M; Trent, E W; Van der Merwe, J H; Van der Walt, D; Vezi, T E; Vos, S C; Waters, M.

NOES-160: Abram, S; Anthony, T G; Arendse, J D; Asiya, S E; Asmal, A K; Batyi, F; Beukman, F; Bhamjee, Y S; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bhoola, R B; Bloem, D V; Bonhomme, T J; Botha, N G W; Burgess, C V; Cachalia, I M; Cele, M A; Chikunga, L S; Cwele, S C; Dambuz, B N; Daniels, P; Davies, R H; Dikgacwi, M M; Dithebe, S L; Dlali, D M; Du Toit, D C ; Fihla, N B; Frolick, C T; Gaum, A H; Gigaba, K M N; Godi, N T; Gololo, C L; Goniwe, M T; Greyling, L W; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A ; Hendrickse, P A C; Hogan, B A; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, C B; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khumalo, K K; Khumalo, K M; Khunou, N P; Komphela, B M; Koornhof, G W; Kotwal, Z; Landers, L T; Lekgetho, G; Lekgoro, M M S; Likotsi, M T; Lishivha, T E; Louw, S K; Luthuli, A N; Maake, J J; Mabe, L L; Mabena, D C; Madasa, Z L; Madella, A F; Maduma, L D; Magau, K R; Magubane, N E ; Mahlaba, T L; Mahlangu-Nkabinde, G L; Mahote, S; Maja, S J; Maloyi, P D N; Maluleka, H P; Maluleke, D K; Martins, B A D; Mashangoane, P R; Mashiane, L M; Mashigo, R J; Masutha, T M; Mathibela, N F; Matlala, M H; Matsemela, M L; Mbili, M E; Mbombo, N D; Meruti, M V; Mgabadel, H C; Mkhize, Z S; Mkongi, B M; Mnguni, B A; Mnyandu, B J; Moatshe, M S; Modisenyane, L J; Mogale, O M; Mogase, I D; Mohamed, I J; Mohlaloga, M R; Mokoena, A D; Molefe, C T; Moloto, K A; Montsitsi, S D; Morobi, D M; Mosala, B G; Moss, L N; Moss, M I; Motubatse-Houkpatin, S D; Mshudulu, S A; Mthembu, B; Mthethwa, E N; Mtshali, E; Mzondeki, M J G; Nawa, Z N; Ndzanga, R A; Nel, A C; Nene, M J ; Nene, N M; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngaleka, E; Ngcengwane, N D; Ngcobo, B T; Ngcobo, E N N; Ngculu, L V J; Ngele, N J; Ngwenya, W; Nhlengethwa, D G; Njikelana, S J ; Nogumla, R Z; Ntuli, B M; Ntuli, M M; Ntuli, R S; Nxumalo, M D; Nyambi, A J; Nzimande, L P M; Olifant, D A A; Phadagi, M G; Phungula, J P; Pieterse, R D; Rajbally, S ; Ramodibe, D M; Ramotsamai, C P M; Rasmeni, S M; Rwexana, S P; Saloojee, E; Schippers, J; Schneemann, G D; Seadimo, M D; Sefularo, M; Siboz, S ; Sithole, D J; Smith, V G; Solo, B M; Soty, M M; Surty, M E ; Thabethe, E; Tinto, B; Tolo, L J; Tsenoli, S L; Tshivhase, T J; Tshwete, P; Vadi, I; Van den Heever, R P Z; Van der Merwe, S C ; Van Wyk, A.

Question not agreed to.

Amendments accordingly negated.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES-160: Abram, S; Anthony, T G; Arendse, J D; Asiya, S E; Asmal, A K; Batyi, F; Beukman, F; Bhamjee, Y S; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bhoola, R B; Bloem, D V; Bonhomme, T J; Botha, N G W; Burgess, C V; Cachalia, I M; Cele, M A; Chikunga, L S; Cwele, S C; Dambuza, B N; Daniels, P; Davies, R H; Dikgacwi, M M; Dithebe, S L; Dlali, D M; Du Toit, D C ; Fihla, N B; Frolick, C T; Gaum, A H; Gigaba, K M N; Gololo, C L; Goniwe, M T; Greyling, L W; Gumede, D M; Hanekom, D A ; Hendrickse, P A C; Hogan, B A; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, C B; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khumalo, K K; Khumalo, K M; Khunou, N P; Komphela, B M; Koornhof, G W; Kotwal, Z; Landers, L T; Lekgetho, G; Lekgoro, M M S; Lishivha, T E; Louw, S K; Luthuli, A N; Maake, J J; Mabe, L L; Mabena, D C; Madasa, Z L; Madella, A F; Maduma, L D; Magau, K R; Magubane, N E ; Mahlaba, T L; Mahlangu-Nkabinde, G L; Mahote, S; Maja, S J; Maloyi, P D N; Maluleka, H P; Maluleke, D K; Manana, M N S; Martins, B A D; Mashangoane, P R; Mashiane, L M; Mashigo, R J; Masutha, T M; Mathibela, N F; Matlala, M H; Matsemela, M L; Mbili, M E; Mbombo, N D; Meruti, M V; Mgabadelo, H C; Mkhize, Z S; Mkongi, B M; Mnguni, B A; Mnyandu, B J; Moatshe, M S; Modisenyane, L J; Mogale, O M; Mogase, I D; Mohamed, I J; Mohlaloga, M R; Mokoena, A D; Molefe, C T; Moloto, K A; Montsitsi, S D; Morobi, D M; Mosala, B G; Moss, L N; Moss, M I; Motubatse-Houkpatin, S D; Mshudulu, S A; Mthembu, B; Mthethwa, E N; Mtshali, E; Mzondeki, M J G; Nawa, Z N; Ndzanga, R A; Nel, A C; Nene, M J ; Nene, N M; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngaleka, E; Ngcengwane, N D; Ngcobo, B T; Ngcobo, E N N; Ngculu, L V J; Ngele, N J; Ngwenya, W; Nhlengethwa, D G; Njikelana, S J ; Nogumla, R Z; Ntuli, B M; Ntuli, M M; Ntuli, R S; Nxumalo, M D; Nxumalo, S N ; Nyambi, A J; Nzimande, L P M; Olifant, D A A; Phadagi, M G; Phungula, J P; Pieterse, R D; Rajbally, S ; Ramodibe, D M; Ramotsamai, C P M; Rasmeni, S M; Rwexana, S P; Saloojee, E; Schippers, J; Schneemann, G D; Seadimo, M D; Sefularo, M; Siboza, S ; Sithole, D J; Smith, V G; Solo, B M; Soty, M M; Surty, M E ; Thabethe, E; Tinto, B; Tolo, L J; Tsenoli, S L; Tshivhase, T J; Tshwete, P; Vadi, I; Van den Heever, R P Z; Van der Merwe, S C ; Van Wyk, A.

NOES-45: Bhengu, M J; Bici, J; Blanché, J P I; Chang, E S; Coetzee, R; Cupido, H B ; Davidson, I O; Ditshetelo, P H K; Doman, W P; Dreyer, A M; Dudley, C; Ellis, M J; Gibson, D H M; Jankielsohn, R; King, R J; Kohler-Barnard, D; Labuschagne, L B; Leon, A J; Meshoe, K R J; Minnie, K J; Morgan, G R; Mulder, C P; Nkabinde, N C; Pule, B E; Rabinowitz, R; Roopnarain, U; Sayedali-Shah, M R; Schmidt, H C; Seaton, S A; Selfe, J; Semple, J A; Sibuyana, M W; Sigcau , S N; Simmons, S; Smith, P F; Smuts, M; Spies, W D; Steyn, A C; Swathe, M M; Trent, E W; Van der Merwe, J H; Van der Walt, D; Vezi, T E; Vos, S C; Waters, M.

Question agreed to.

Motion accordingly agreed to.

8. [17:52] The Chief Whip of the Majority Party moved: That the House –

- (1) notes the reprehensible actions of the Hon D H M Gibson, MP, Chief Whip of the Democratic Alliance, and other members of the Democratic Alliance, accompanied by members of the news media, who attempted to enter a private property belonging to President Thabo Mbeki and First Lady Mrs Zanele Mbeki, on Friday, 1 September 2006, in Johannesburg;
- (2) recognises that the Constitution of the Republic provides that:
 - (a) The Republic of South Africa is one, democratic state founded on the following values: human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights and freedoms;
 - (b) Everyone has inherent dignity and the right to have their dignity respected and protected; and
 - (c) Everyone has the right to privacy, which includes the right not to have their person or home searched;

- (3) further recognises that the Constitution, national legislation and the Rules of Parliament provide for a variety of mechanisms to ensure openness, transparency and accountability with regard to the use of public funds;
- (4) believes that –
- a) the conduct of the Hon D H M Gibson, MP, exceeded all bounds of political maturity, was undignified and unbecoming of that of a Member of this House;
 - b) had the Hon D H M Gibson, MP, intended to conduct *bona fide* parliamentary oversight, he would have made use of the many mechanisms that exist for this purpose, and that his failure to do so is indicative of a calculated attempt to make cheap political capital;
 - c) Parliament and its Members have a duty, at all times, to be at the forefront of upholding the values of human dignity, the achievement of equality and the advancement of human rights and freedoms and of good governance, transparency and accountability; and
 - d) the actions of the Hon D H M Gibson, MP, constitute an infringement of the human dignity and privacy of President and First Lady Mrs Mbeki and an assault on the dignity and integrity of the Office of the President; and
- (5) therefore resolves –
- (a) to condemn, in the strongest terms, the actions of the Hon D H M Gibson, MP; and
 - (b) to call upon the Hon D H M Gibson, MP, to apologise unreservedly to President Thabo Mbeki and First Lady Mrs Zanele Mbeki, Parliament and the nation for his actions.

House Chairperson Ms C-S Botha gave a ruling on remarks made by Mr R B Bhoola during the debate, and directed him to withdraw the remarks.

When Mr Bhoola indicated that he was not prepared to withdraw the remarks, having disregarded the authority of the Chair, he was ordered to withdraw from the Chamber for the remainder of the day's sitting.

The member thereupon withdrew.

Debate concluded.

Mr M J Ellis moved as an amendment: To omit all the words after "That" and to substitute:

the House declines to take notice of the actions of the Hon D H M Gibson outside the National Assembly on the grounds that such actions are not the business of the House, and to express an opinion on them is impertinence.

Question put: That the amendment moved by Mr M J Ellis be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES-31: Bhengu, M J; Blanché, J P I; Cele, M A; Coetzee, R; Davidson, I O; Doman, W P; Dreyer, A M; Ellis, M J; Gibson, D H M; Jankielsohn, R; King, R J; Kohler-Barnard, D; Labuschagne, L B; Leon, A J; Minnie, K J; Morgan, G R; Rabinowitz, R; Sayedali-Shah, M R; Schmidt, H C; Seaton, S A; Selfe, J; Semple, J A; Sibuyana, M W; Smuts, M; Steyn, A C; Swathe, M M; Trent, E W; Van der Merwe, J H; Van der Walt, D; Vos, S C; Waters, M.

NOES-153: Abram, S; Anthony, T G; Arendse, J D; Asiya, S E; Asmal, A K; Beukman, F; Bhamjee, Y S; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bloem, D V; Bonhomme, T J; Botha, N G W; Burgess, C V; Chikunga, L S; Combrinck, J J; Cwele, S C; Dambuza, B N; Daniels, P; Dikgacwi, M M; Dithebe, S L; Doidge, G Q M; Fihla, N B; Frolick, C T; Gaum, A H; Gigaba, K M N; Goniwe, M T; Green, L M; Gumede, D M; Hendrickse, P A C; Hogan, B A; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khumalo, K K; Khumalo, K M; Khunou, N P; Komphela, B M; Koornhof, G W; Kotwal, Z; Landers, L T; Lekgetho, G; Lekgoro, M M S; Lishivha, T E; Louw, S K; Luthuli, A N; Maake, J J; Mabe, L L; Mabena, D C; Madasa, Z L; Madella, A F; Maduma, L D; Magau, K R; Magubane, N E ; Mahlaba, T L; Mahlangu-Nkabinde, G L; Mahlawe, N M; Mahote, S; Maja, S J; Maloyi, P D N; Maluleka, H P; Maluleke, D K; Martins, B A D; Mashangoane, P R; Mashiane, L M; Mashigo, R J; Masutha, T M; Mathibela, N F; Matlala, M H; Matsemela, M L; Mbili, M E; Mbombo, N D; Meruti, M V; Mgabadeli, H C; Mkhize, Z S; Mkongi, B M; Mnguni, B A; Mnyandu, B J; Moatshe, M S; Modisenyane, L J; Mogale, O M; Mogase, I D; Mohamed, I J; Mohlaloga, M R; Molefe, C T; Moloto, K A; Montsitsi, S D; Morobi, D M; Mosala, B G; Moss, M I; Mshudulu, S A; Mthembu, B; Mthethwa, E N; Mtshali, E; Mzondeki, M J G; Nawa, Z N; Ndzanga, R A; Nel, A C; Nene, M J ; Nene, N M; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngaleka, E; Ngcengwane, N D; Ngcobo, B T; Ngcobo, E N N; Ngculu, L V J; Ngele, N J; Ngwenya, W; Nhlengethwa, D G; Njikelana, S J ; Njobe, M A A; Nkabinde, N C; Nogumla, R Z; Ntuli, B M; Ntuli, M M; Ntuli, R S; Nxumalo, M D; Nxumalo, S N ; Nyambi, A J; Nzimande, L P M; Olifant, D A A; Phadagi, M G; Phungula, J P; Pieterse, R D; Rajbally, S ; Ramodibe, D M; Ramotsamai, C P M; Rasmeni, S M; Rwexana, S P; Saloojee, E; Schippers, J; Schneemann, G D; Seadimo, M D; Sefularo, M; Sibanyoni, J B; Siboza, S ; Sigcau , S N; Sithole, D J; Smith, V G; Solo, B M; Soty, M M; Surty, M E ; Thabethe, E; Tinto, B; Tolo, L J; Tsenoli, S L; Tshivhase, T J; Tshwete, P; Vadi, I; Van den Heever, R P Z; Van der Merwe, S C ; Van Wyk, A.

ABSTAIN-4: Greyling, L W; Mulder, C P; Spies, W D; Vezi, T E.

Question not agreed to.

Amendment accordingly negatived.

Question put: That the motion moved by the Chief Whip of the Majority Party be agreed to.

Division demanded.

The House divided.

AYES-156: Abram, S; Anthony, T G; Arendse, J D; Asiya, S E; Asmal, A K; Beukman, F; Bhamjee, Y S; Bhengu, F; Bhengu, P; Bloem, D V; Bonhomme, T J; Botha, N G W; Burgess, C V; Cachalia, I M; Cele, M A; Chikunga, L S; Combrinck, J J; Cwele, S C; Dambuza, B N; Daniels, P; Dikgacwi, M M; Dithebe, S L; Doidge, G Q M; Fihla, N B; Frolick, C T; Gaum, A H; Gigaba, K M N; Goniwe, M T; Green, L M; Gumede, D M; Hendrickse, P A C; Hogan, B A; Jeffery, J H; Johnson, M; Kalako, M U; Kekana, C D; Khoarai, L P; Khumalo, K K; Khumalo, K M; Khunou, N P; Komphela, B M; Koornhof, G W; Kotwal, Z; Landers, L T; Lekgetho, G; Lekgoro, M M S; Lishivha, T E; Louw, S K; Luthuli, A N; Maake, J J; Mabe, L L; Mabena, D C; Madasa, Z L; Madella, A F; Maduma, L D; Magau, K R; Magubane, N E ; Mahlaba, T L; Mahlangu-Nkabinde, G L; Mahlawe, N M; Mahote, S; Maja, S J; Maloyi, P D N; Maluleka, H P; Maluleke, D K; Martins, B A D; Mashangoane, P R; Mashiane, L M; Mashigo, R J; Masutha, T M; Mathibela, N F; Matlala, M H; Matsemela, M L; Mbili, M E; Mbombo, N D; Meruti, M V; Mgabadeli, H C; Mkhize, Z S; Mkongi, B M; Mnguni, B A; Mnyandu, B J; Moatshe, M S; Modisenyane, L J; Mogale, O M; Mogase, I D; Mohamed, I J; Mohlaloga, M R; Molefe, C T; Moloto, K A; Montsitsi, S D; Morobi, D M; Mosala, B G; Moss, M I; Motubatse-Houngpatin, S D; Mshudulu, S A; Mthembu, B; Mthethwa, E N; Mtshali, E; Mzondeki, M J G; Nawa, Z N; Ndzanga, R A; Nel, A C; Nene, M J ; Nene, N M; Newhoudt-Druchen, W S; Ngaleka, E; Ngcengwane, N D; Ngcobo, B T; Ngcobo, E N N; Ngculu, L V J; Ngele, N J; Ngwenya, W; Nhlengethwa, D G; Njikelana, S J ; Njobe, M A A; Nkabinde, N C; Nogumla, R Z; Ntuli, B M; Ntuli, M M; Ntuli, R S; Ntuli, S B; Nxumalo, M D; Nxumalo, S N ; Nyambi, A J; Nzimande, L P M;

Olifant, D A A; Phungula, J P; Pieterse, R D; Rajbally, S ; Ramodibe, D M; Ramotsamai, C P M; Rasmeni, S M; Rwexana, S P; Saloojee, E; Schippers, J; Schneemann, G D; Seadimo, M D; Sefularo, M; Sibanyoni, J B; Siboza, S ; Sigcau , S N; Sithole, D J; Smith, V G; Solo, B M; Soty, M M; Surty, M E ; Thabethe, E; Tinto, B; Tolo, L J; Tsenoli, S L; Tshivhase, T J; Tshwete, P; Vadi, I; Van den Heever, R P Z; Van der Merwe, S C ; Van Wyk, A.

NOES-32: Bhengu, M J; Blanché, J P I; Coetzee, R; Davidson, I O; Doman, W P; Dreyer, A M; Ellis, M J; Gibson, D H M; Jankielsohn, R; King, R J; Kohler-Barnard, D; Labuschagne, L B; Leon, A J; Minnie, K J; Morgan, G R; Mulder, C P; Rabinowitz, R; Sayedali-Shah, M R; Schmidt, H C; Seaton, S A; Selfe, J; Semple, J A; Sibuyana, M W; Smuts, M; Spies, W D; Steyn, A C; Swathe, M M; Trent, E W; Van der Merwe, J H; Van der Walt, D; Vos, S C; Waters, M.

ABSTAIN-1: Greyling, L W.

Question agreed to.

Motion accordingly agreed to.

9. [18:58] Mr D H M Gibson made a statement in regard to the motion of the Chief Whip of the Majority Party on his conduct.
10. The House adjourned at 19:01.

Z A DINGANI
Secretary to Parliament